The Ethics of Plea Bargaining

RICHARD L. LIPPKE

OXFORD MONOGRAPHS ON CRIMINAL LAW AND JUSTICE
Contents

Acknowledgments
Abbreviations

Introduction
Delineating the issues: the forms and limits of plea bargaining

1. Waiver Rewards and Trial Penalties
   Official tolerance of trial penalties: the Bordenkircher case
   Separating waiver rewards from trial penalties
   Detecting trial penalties
   Objections to settlement hearings
   Charges added consequent to failed plea negotiations
   Strategic overcharging
   Suboptimal sentencing schemes
   Concluding remarks

2. Against Trial Penalties
   Moral basis of the right to trial
   The variety of defendants and the hazards of unilateral imposition of trial penalties
   Further arguments against trial penalties
   Trial penalties as a means to fair outcomes?
   The exception that proves the rule?
   Trial penalties and duress
   A lingering doubt
   Concluding remarks

3. Waiver Rewards and Deserved Punishment
   Desert-based approaches to the justification of legal punishment
   Rewards for acknowledging guilt
   Expanding deserved punishment
   The problem of innocent defendants
   Charge bargaining
   Waiver rewards in the non-ideal world
   Concluding remarks

4. Remorse and Waiver Rewards
   Two preliminary points
   What is remorse?
   Retributive arguments for remorse-based sentence mitigation
   Remorse and crime reduction
   Conclusions
CONTENTS

5. Waiver Rewards and the Reduction of Crime
   A preliminary point
   Easterbrook's defense of plea bargaining
   Initial problems with Easterbrook's account
   The more subtle costs to robust plea bargaining
   Bringing the background forward: is more punishment always better?
   Concluding remarks
   119
   120
   122
   125
   130
   136
   145

6. Rewarding Cooperation
   Rewarding betrayal, penalizing loyalty
   Absolute injustice and the duty to cooperate
   Comparative justice
   Cooperating witness reliability
   Concluding remarks
   146
   149
   151
   157
   161
   166

7. Plea Bargains as Contracts
   Initial doubts
   Background conditions
   Dubious prosecutorial tactics
   Waiver rewards and the aims of punishment
   Defendants' entitlements
   Honorable negotiated settlements
   167
   171
   173
   176
   181
   183
   188

8. Principled Criminal Prosecution and Half-Loaves
   Some preliminary points
   Criminal prosecution and principled state actors
   Arguments in support of half-loaf plea bargaining
   The problem of innocent defendants
   Concluding remarks
   191
   193
   196
   204
   212
   215

9. Plea Bargaining and Getting at the Truth
   A preliminary point
   The deficiencies of robust plea bargaining in getting at the truth
   Will adversary trials fare better?
   Could plea bargaining be made to better get at the truth?
   Truth and the limits of charge-adjudication schemes
   217
   220
   221
   225
   230
   238

Epilogue
Bibliography
Index